

## ON THE CONGRUENT NUMBER PROBLEM OVER INTEGERS OF REAL NUMBER FIELDS

---

ALBERTAS ZINEVIČIUS

*Department of Mathematics and Informatics,  
Vilnius University,  
Naugarduko 24, Vilnius, LT-03225,  
Lithuania*

and

*Institute of Mathematics and Informatics,  
Akademijos 4, Vilnius, LT-08663,  
Lithuania*

*Email: albertas.zinevicius@mif.vu.lt*

---

ABSTRACT. Given a real finite field extension  $K/\mathbb{Q}$  of degree  $d$  and class number  $h_K$  and a positive integer  $a$ , we show that there is a set of rational prime numbers of relative density at least  $1/(2dh_K)$  that have a principal prime factor  $\pi\mathcal{O}_K \subset \mathcal{O}_K$  of degree one such that the equation  $a\pi^2 = x^4 - y^2$  has no nontrivial solutions in  $\mathcal{O}_K$ .

---

### 1. INTRODUCTION

The classical congruent number problem asks for an algorithm that would decide if a given positive integer  $n$  is the area of a right triangle with rational side lengths. The existence of such a triangle is equivalent to the solvability of the equation

$$(1) \quad y^2 = x^4 - 16n^2$$

in rational numbers  $(x, y)$  with  $x$  nonzero. It is known that the existence of such a (surprisingly simple) algorithm would follow from the conjecture of Birch and Swinnerton-Dyer, as was shown in the work of Tunnell [12]. It was noted by Jedrzejak [6] that, under assumption of the same conjecture, Tunnell's theorem together with the work of Tada [10] imply that every positive integer is the area of some right triangle with side lengths in the quartic extension  $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{3}, \sqrt{5})$ .

It is difficult to expect, on the other hand, that the equation (1) could have solutions among the integers  $\mathcal{O}_K$  of a fixed number field  $K$  for all  $n$ . Indeed, as it was remarked by Stoll [9], the conjecture of Bombieri-Lang suggests the opposite.

---

2010 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 11D45, 11H06.

*Key words and phrases.* Congruent numbers, real number fields, rings of integers, prime ideals.

That this can never happen when  $K$  is a cyclic extension, can be concluded from the following statement that we showed in [13]:

**Theorem A.** *Let  $K$  be a finite Galois extension of the field of rational numbers with cyclic Galois group  $\text{Gal}(K/\mathbb{Q})$  and let  $a$  be a nonzero (rational) integer. Then the set of rational prime numbers  $p$  for which the equation*

$$(2) \quad ap^2 = x^4 - y^2$$

*in unknowns  $x, y$  does not have a solution  $(x, y) \in \mathcal{O}_K \times \mathcal{O}_K$  with  $x \neq 0$ , has lower relative density at least  $1/2$  in the set of (rational) prime numbers that remain inert in  $K$ .*

The conjectural solvability of (1) in some number fields for all positive integers  $n$  raises the question of whether one could expect to find a number field  $K$  in which all the equations (1) were solvable when the parameter  $n$  also varies over  $K$  (rather than  $\mathbb{Q}$ ). This still has the same geometric interpretation when the extension  $K$  is real. The analogous question for integers of number fields becomes easier and can be settled:

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $K$  be a finite real extension of the field of rational numbers, of degree  $d$  and class number  $h_K$ , and let  $a$  be a positive integer. Then there is a set of rational prime numbers  $p$  of relative density at least  $1/(2dh_K)$ , such that the principal ideal  $p\mathcal{O}_K$  has a principal prime factor  $\pi\mathcal{O}_K$  of degree one for which the equation*

$$(3) \quad a\pi^2 = x^4 - y^2$$

*in unknowns  $x, y$  does not have a solution  $(x, y) \in \mathcal{O}_K \times \mathcal{O}_K$  with  $x \neq 0$ .*

Most of the proof of this observation translates *mutatis mutandis* from the proof of Theorem A, which is indebted to the results of Jarden-Narkiewicz and Green-Tao. Additionally, a fundamental result of class field theory is employed in Lemma 3. The proof does not suggest that the density  $1/(2dh_K)$  could be precise for some number fields  $K$ . The author of this note would find it interesting to see a demonstration that (1) does not have solutions over  $\mathcal{O}_K$  for many rational integer values of the parameter  $n$ .

## 2. PROOF OF THEOREM 1

For the proof of the theorem we borrow two statements from [4] and [5], respectively, that we state here as lemmas:

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $A$  be any subset of the prime numbers of positive relative upper density. Then  $A$  contains infinitely many arithmetic progressions of length  $l$  for all  $l$ .*

**Lemma 2.** *If  $R$  is a finitely generated integral domain of zero characteristic and  $l$  is an integer, then there exists a constant  $A_l(R)$  such that every arithmetic progression in  $R$  having more than  $A_l(R)$  elements contains an element which is not a sum of  $l$  units.*

In addition, we will use the following lemma:

**Lemma 3.** *The relative density of prime numbers  $p \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that the principal ideal  $p\mathcal{O}_K \subset \mathcal{O}_K$  has a principal prime factor  $\mathfrak{p} = \pi\mathcal{O}_K$  of degree one that remains inert in the quadratic extension  $K(\sqrt{-a})/K$ , is at least  $1/(2dh_K)$ .*

*Proof of Lemma 3.* Notice first that, since  $K$  is a subfield of the real numbers, its Hilbert class field  $\text{Cl}(K)$  is also a subfield of the real numbers (as  $\text{Cl}(K)/K$  must be unramified at the infinite prime). Therefore there is an element  $\sigma \in \text{Gal}(\text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a})/K)$  that fixes  $\text{Cl}(K)$  but is not the identity automorphism.

Let  $L$  be the Galois closure of the extension  $\text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a})/\mathbb{Q}$ . Since the extension  $L/\text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a})$  is Galois and  $\sigma \in \text{Aut}(\text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a}))$ , one can extend  $\sigma$  to an element of  $\text{Gal}(L/\text{Cl}(K))$ . More precisely, there are  $[L : \text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a})]$  distinct elements  $\sigma_j \in \text{Gal}(L/\text{Cl}(K)), j = 1, \dots, [L : \text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a})]$ , that coincide with  $\sigma$  on the subfield  $\text{Cl}(K)(\sqrt{-a})$ .

Recall that for any tower of number fields  $E \subset E' \subset E''$ , where  $E''/E$  is Galois, the decomposition type of a prime ideal  $\mathfrak{q} \subset \mathcal{O}_E$ , that does not divide  $\Delta_{E''/E}$ , in the extension  $E'/E$  coincides with the cycle structure of the permutation of  $\text{Gal}(E''/E)/\text{Gal}(E''/E')$  that is induced by the action of (any) Frobenius element  $\text{Frob}_{\mathfrak{q}}$  of the prime ideal  $\mathfrak{q}$ .

When  $E = \mathbb{Q}, E' = K, E'' = L$  and  $p$  is a rational prime that does not divide the discriminant  $\Delta_{L/\mathbb{Q}}$ , it follows that the ideal  $p\mathcal{O}_K \subset \mathcal{O}_K$  has a prime factor  $\mathfrak{p} \subset \mathcal{O}_K$  of degree one if and only if the conjugacy class of the Frobenius element  $\text{Frob}_p \in \text{Gal}(L/\mathbb{Q})$  intersects the subgroup  $\text{Gal}(L/K)$  (see, e.g., [7]). In particular, when the conjugacy class of  $\text{Frob}_p$  contains one of  $\sigma_j$  as above,  $p\mathcal{O}_K$  has a prime factor  $\mathfrak{p}$  of degree one.

Likewise, when  $E = K, E' = \text{Cl}(K), E'' = L$ , it follows that a prime ideal  $\mathfrak{p} \subset \mathcal{O}_K$  as above splits completely in the extension  $\text{Cl}(K)/K$ . Indeed, we may assume, without a loss of generality, that

$$\text{Frob}_p(x) \equiv x^{\#\mathbb{Z}/p\mathbb{Z}} \pmod{\mathfrak{q}}$$

for all  $x \in \mathcal{O}_L$  and a prime ideal  $\mathfrak{q} \subset \mathcal{O}_L$  that lies over  $\mathfrak{p}$  (by replacing  $\text{Frob}_p$ , if necessary, with another element from the conjugacy class of  $\text{Frob}_p$ ). Since  $\mathfrak{p}$  is of degree 1, we have  $\#\mathbb{Z}/p\mathbb{Z} = \#\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{p}$ . Hence holds

$$\text{Frob}_p(x) \equiv x^{\#\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{p}} \pmod{\mathfrak{q}},$$

for all  $x \in \mathcal{O}_L$ . Thus  $\text{Frob}_p$  is also a Frobenius element  $\text{Frob}_{\mathfrak{p}}$  of  $\mathfrak{p}$  (with respect to the extension  $L/K$ ). The cycle structure of the permutation of the group  $\text{Gal}(L/K)/\text{Gal}(L/\text{Cl}(K))$  induced by  $\text{Frob}_{\mathfrak{p}}$  is then the same as that induced by any  $\sigma_j$  that is in the same conjugacy class as  $\text{Frob}_p$ . Consequently, it is the product of 1-cycles (since  $\sigma_j \in \text{Gal}(L/\text{Cl}(K))$  acts on  $\text{Gal}(L/K)/\text{Gal}(L/\text{Cl}(K))$  trivially).

On the other hand, the permutation of  $\text{Gal}(L/K)/\text{Gal}(L/K(\sqrt{-a}))$  induced by the  $\sigma_j$  is not the trivial one since  $\sigma_j \notin \text{Gal}(L/K(\sqrt{-a}))$ . Consequently, the prime ideal  $\mathfrak{p}$  remains inert in the extension  $K(\sqrt{-a})/K$ .

A fundamental result of class field theory asserts that prime ideals of  $K$  that split completely in the extension  $\text{Cl}(K)/K$  are principal [8]. Thus  $\mathfrak{p} = \pi\mathcal{O}_K$  for some prime element  $\pi \in \mathcal{O}_K$  that remains prime in  $\mathcal{O}_{K(\sqrt{-a})}$ .

By the Chebotarev density theorem [11], the density of rational prime numbers  $p$  with Frobenius symbol  $\text{Frob}_p$  (with respect to the extension  $L/\mathbb{Q}$ ) in the same conjugacy class as some  $\sigma_j$  is equal to the number of elements in those conjugacy

classes of  $\text{Gal}(L/\mathbb{Q})$  that contain some  $\sigma_j$ , divided by the size of the Galois group  $\text{Gal}(L/\mathbb{Q})$ . It is therefore, at least

$$\#\{\sigma_j\}/\#\text{Gal}(L/\mathbb{Q}) = ([L : \text{Cl}(K)]/2)/([\text{Cl}(K) : \mathbb{Q}][L : \text{Cl}(K)]) = 1/(2dh_K).$$

□

*Proof of Theorem 1.* Let  $\mathfrak{p} = \pi\mathcal{O}_K$  be a prime ideal as in Lemma 3. If the equation

$$a\pi^2 = x^4 - y^2 = (x^2 + y)(x^2 - y)$$

has a solution in  $\mathcal{O}_K$  with  $x \neq 0$  then either both  $x^2 - y, x^2 + y$  are divisible by  $\pi$  or not. In the first case,

$$\begin{cases} x^2 - y = \pi r \\ x^2 + y = \pi ar^{-1} \end{cases}$$

for some  $r \in \mathcal{O}_K$  that divides  $a$ . Denote by  $\sigma$  the generator of  $\text{Gal}(K(\sqrt{-a})/K)$ . By adding the equations one obtains

$$2x^2r = \pi(r^2 + a) = \pi(r + \sqrt{-1})(r - \sqrt{-a}) = \pi(r + \sqrt{-1})\sigma(r + \sqrt{-a}).$$

We thus can see that, since  $\pi$  is a prime element of the ring of integers of  $K(\sqrt{-a})$  that is mapped to an associate of itself by  $\sigma$ , the highest power of  $\pi$  that divides the right-hand side must be odd. On the other hand, the highest power of any prime element that divides the left-hand side and does not divide  $2a$  is even. Therefore, the first case may hold for at most finitely many prime ideals  $\pi\mathcal{O}_K$ . We thus may restrict ourselves to the second case, i.e., assume that

$$\begin{cases} x^2 - y = \pi^2 ar^{-1} \\ x^2 + y = r \end{cases}$$

holds for some  $r \in \mathcal{O}_K$  that divides  $a$ . By adding the equations again, one obtains

$$2x^2r = r^2 + \pi^2 a.$$

Let  $K'$  be a field extension of  $K$  that is generated by elements of the form  $\sqrt{r}$ , where  $r \in \mathcal{O}_K$  divide  $a$ . Up to multiplication by units, there are only finitely many such  $r$ . Let  $r_1, \dots, r_v$  be their representatives. The Dirichlet unit theorem [2] tells also that the multiplicative group of units of  $\mathcal{O}_K$  is finitely generated. Let  $e_1, \dots, e_s$  be its generators. Then  $K' = K(\sqrt{2}, \sqrt{e_1}, \dots, \sqrt{e_s}, \sqrt{r_1}, \dots, \sqrt{r_v})$  is a finite extension of  $K$ . Over  $\mathcal{O}_{K'}$  one can write

$$(x\sqrt{2r} - \pi\sqrt{a})(x\sqrt{2r} + \pi\sqrt{a}) = r^2.$$

Hence both  $x\sqrt{2r} - \pi\sqrt{a}, x\sqrt{2r} + \pi\sqrt{a}$  are divisors of  $a^2$  in  $\mathcal{O}_{K'}$ . Consequently,  $2\pi\sqrt{a}$  is a sum of two divisors of  $a^2$ .

We claim that such ideals  $\mathfrak{p} = \pi\mathcal{O}_K$  have density zero among the prime ideals of the ring  $\mathcal{O}_K$ . Let  $M$  denote the Galois closure of the field extension  $K'/\mathbb{Q}$ . Note that there is a subset  $G_\pi \subset \text{Gal}(M/\mathbb{Q})$  of cardinality  $d$  such that  $Nm_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\pi) =$

$\prod_{\sigma \in G_\pi} \sigma(\pi)$ . Thus,

$$\prod_{\sigma \in G_\pi} \sigma(2\pi\sqrt{a}) = Nm_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\pi) \prod_{\sigma \in G_\pi} \sigma(2\sqrt{a}).$$

On the other hand,  $\sigma(2\pi\sqrt{a})$  is a sum of two divisors of  $a^2$  in  $\mathcal{O}_M$ , and hence  $\prod_{\sigma \in G_\pi} \sigma(2\pi\sqrt{a})$  is a sum of  $2^d$  divisors of  $a^{2d}$  in  $\mathcal{O}_M$ . Furthermore, since  $\mathfrak{p}$  is of degree one,

$$|Nm_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\pi)| = \#\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{p} = p.$$

Had prime ideals of the form  $\mathfrak{p} = \pi\mathcal{O}_K$  positive upper density among the prime ideals of  $\mathcal{O}_K$ , then the upper density of rational prime numbers of the form  $|Nm_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\pi)|$  would also be positive in the set of rational prime numbers. Moreover, there would exist a fixed  $G \subset \text{Gal}(M/\mathbb{Q})$  such that  $G_\pi = G$  for a positive fraction of the prime numbers  $|Nm_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\pi)|$ . It would follow from the Lemma 1 that there must exist arbitrarily long arithmetic progressions with elements of the form  $Nm_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\pi) \prod_{\sigma \in G} \sigma(2\sqrt{a})$ .

Let  $r'_1, \dots, r'_l \in \mathcal{O}_M$  be the representatives of the divisors of  $a^{2d}$  modulo the multiplicative group of units of  $\mathcal{O}_M$ . Notice that the ring  $\mathcal{O}_M[1/r'_1, \dots, 1/r'_l]$  is finitely generated. Furthermore, any term of an arithmetic progression as above is a sum of  $2^d$  units in this ring. However, by Lemma 2, the length of such arithmetic progressions cannot be arbitrarily large, a contradiction. Thus, prime ideals  $\pi\mathcal{O}_K$  as in Lemma 3 for which (3) holds have density zero. □

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Chandrasekar V., *The congruent number problem*, Resonance **3**(8), 33-45 (1998).
- [2] Narkiewicz W., *Elementary and analytic theory of algebraic numbers*, 3rd ed., p. 98, Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg (2004).
- [3] Gironde E., Gonzalez-Diez G., Gonzalez-Jimenez E., Steuding R., Steuding J., *Right triangles with algebraic sides and elliptic curves over number fields*, Math. Slovaca **59**(3), 299-306 (2009).
- [4] Green B., Tao T., *The primes contain arbitrarily long arithmetic progressions*, Annals of Mathematics **167**(2), 481-547 (2008).
- [5] Jarden M., Narkiewicz W., *On sums of units*, Monatsh. Math. **150**(4), 327-332 (2006).
- [6] Jedrzejak T., *Congruent numbers over real number fields*, Colloquium Mathematicum **128**(2), 179-186 (2012).
- [7] Neukirch J., *Algebraische Zahlentheorie*, p. 570, Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg (2007).
- [8] Neukirch J., *Algebraische Zahlentheorie*, p. 429, Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg (2007).
- [9] Stoll M., personal communication (2014).
- [10] Tada M., *Congruent numbers over real quadratic fields*, Hiroshima Math. J. **31**(2), 331-343 (2001).
- [11] Tschebotareff N., *Die Bestimmung der Dichtigkeit einer Menge von Primzahlen, welche zu einer gegebenen Substitutionsklasse gehören*, Math. Ann. **95**, 191-228 (1925).
- [12] Tunnell J.B., *A Classical Diophantine problem and modular forms of Weight 3/2*, Inventiones Mathematicae **72**, 323-334 (1983).
- [13] Zinevičius A., *On the congruent number problem over integers of cyclic extensions* (to appear in Mathematica Slovaca).